

IOM Project

**Economic Rehabilitation for Survivors of
Trafficking in India**

External Evaluation Report

July 2006

By Lacey Ilene Ruben

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART ONE: OVERVIEW OF THE PROJECT

1. Introduction

- 1.1 Trafficking of Women and Girls for Commercial Sexual Exploitation in India
- 1.2 Evaluation Scope and Methodology

2. Project Strategy and Components

- 2.1 Project Design
- 2.2 Project Components

PART TWO: ANALYSIS OF PROJECT PERFORMANCE AND ACHIEVEMENTS

3. Validity of Design

- 3.1 Design of Project Strategy
- 3.2 Monitoring and Indicators
- 3.3 Return Assistance

4. Relevance

- 4.1 Relevance of the Target Group
- 4.2 Relevance of Selected NGO Partners

5. Effectiveness

- 5.1 Capacity Building
- 5.2 Psycho-Social Rehabilitation and the Development of Soft Skills
- 5.3 Economic Rehabilitation
- 5.4 Project and Stakeholder Management

6. Efficiency and Cost Effectiveness

- 6.1 Efficiency in Implementing the Project
- 6.2 Cost Effectiveness

7. Sustainability, Outcome and Impact

- 7.1 Sustainability
- 7.2 Outcome and Impact

SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ANNEXES

- 1. Terms of Reference for the Evaluation
- 2. Bibliographical References
- 3. Narrative of Field Visit
- 4. Table of Enterprises and Beneficiaries

PART ONE:
OVERVIEW OF THE PROJECT

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Trafficking of Women and Children for Commercial Sexual Exploitation in India

Throughout Southeast Asia, the trafficking of women and children for commercial sexual exploitation and other illegal purposes has reached alarming proportions. Globally, this industry generates billions of dollars per year, and is one of the largest profit sources for organized crime. Although India is a source, transit and destination country for international trafficking operations, up to 90% of trafficking of Indians takes place within India's borders, within or between Indian states.¹

Significant inequalities of wealth and the breakdown of traditional livelihoods result in such severe poverty in some areas that every family member, including children, becomes an important source of income. Women and girls are especially vulnerable because they are more likely to lack education and marketable skills, and traditionally hold a lower position in society. Traffickers in organized crime networks, often conspiring with relatives and neighbors who act as middlemen, take advantage of these factors. The possibility of earning more money in another state, or receiving an advance payment, may lead some families to disregard the risk of exploitation. However, the victims then find themselves trapped in traumatic, exploitative situations that threaten their physical and psychological well-being.

The Government of India (GoI) has made significant strides in mobilizing its resources to combat trafficking in persons. The Indian constitution explicitly prohibits "traffic in human beings,"² and makes it a criminal offense according to the Penal Code and the Immoral Traffic (Prevention) Act. The Juvenile Justice Act mandates that state governments establish protective homes to accommodate rescued survivors of trafficking, who often fear retribution from their traffickers and stigmatization from their home communities in addition to suffering from medical problems and psychological trauma.

In its counter trafficking efforts, the GoI has engaged India's few but extremely active counter trafficking NGOs, as well as many social service NGOs who have embraced the cause. State governments also partner with local NGOs to regulate the quality of state-run shelters, appoint NGOs to provide nationally mandated services to survivors, and/or donate land and resources to support the work of some NGOs. In many states, the GoI and NGOs have also combined forces to hold information campaigns and health care drives. Law enforcement regularly refers survivors to local NGOs for services. Regional and national counter trafficking networks of government and nongovernmental actors have the potential to coordinate larger-scale counter trafficking activities. However, much of this cooperation continues to take place within states,

¹ Ministry of Home Affairs, India

² Article 23(1).

with significantly less coordination between government offices or NGOs occurring at a regional or national level.

NGOs working in the counter trafficking sector often do not have the adequate resources or expertise to undertake the wide spectrum of activities required to comprehensively address the challenges of reintegration that survivors of trafficking face. Based on IOM's extensive counter trafficking experience, these activities include survivors' facilitated return, appropriate economic rehabilitation and reintegration, assistance in source districts, and access to a full range of social, psychological and mental healthcare treatments.

IOM designed two projects, "Economic Rehabilitation of Trafficked Victims" (ERTV) and "Economic Rehabilitation of Survivors of Trafficking" (ERST), to complement the work and experience of NGOs assisting survivors and take a lead where NGO programs end. This comprehensive approach targets the cycle of poverty that precipitates trafficking in persons, acknowledging that financial independence is important for sustaining survivors' social reintegration and psychological well-being. Funded by the U.S. Department of State's Bureau of Population, Refugees and Migration as part of the Presidential Initiative to combat trafficking in persons, ERTV/ERST was initiated in 2003.

It should be noted that the GoI has maintained a coordinating role for all counter trafficking assistance efforts, including the IOM intervention, by assigning a coordinating function to state or local authorities. Also, as India is not a Member State of IOM, IOM does not have legal status in India. Therefore, IOM's capacity was largely dependent on its informal connections to government, local authorities and NGOs.

1.2 Evaluation Scope and Methodology

The objective of the evaluation was to assess the overall performance and achievements of the two projects based on their established objectives. It will focus on the elaboration of the intervention strategy, including the selection of tools, fields of activity and implementing partners. Implementation will be examined in terms of the projects' contribution to the economic, social and psychological rehabilitation of survivors of trafficking.³

The methodology of this evaluation consisted of an extensive documentation review, field visits to project sites, and a series of interviews and focus groups with stakeholders and beneficiaries. Eight out of thirteen project sites were visited. Interviews and focus groups were conducted based on an interview protocol.

It is important to note the constraints faced during this evaluation. Corporate and government partners were not interviewed due to limited time and staff resources. However, documentation reviews and information collected from NGOs helped to partially address this gap. Also, the evaluation can only speculate as to the long-term impacts of ERTV/ERST; IOM recently completed a separate study to thoroughly measure this. Finally, NGO and IOM staff was present during all interviews and focus groups with beneficiaries, and usually served as interpreters. Recruitment of independent interpreters was not possible due to financial constraints. The

³ For more information see Annex 1 Terms of Reference

evaluation team felt that a staff presence enhanced focus groups by making the beneficiaries more comfortable, but it may have created a bias in the data collection. However, this bias was not clearly identifiable.

The evaluation report consists of two main parts. The first part presents the design and components of the ERTV/ERST project and the roles of different stakeholders, including IOM. The second section analyzes the validity and relevance of the project design, as well as the effectiveness and efficiency of IOM's intervention. It also offers recommendations for investigating causality issues in order to facilitate future extension or replication of the project.

2. PROJECT STRATEGY AND COMPONENTS

This section will briefly present the main components of the project and how they were designed. It is also important to recall that the overall objective is: *“to contribute to the successful and sustainable reintegration of the survivors of trafficking by providing return assistance, psycho social rehabilitation and economic rehabilitation opportunities to those who are ready to go back to their families / states of origin.”*

2.1 Project Design

The design of ERTV was based on an initial assessment of counter trafficking efforts in India, carried out in 2001. The components of ERTV, implemented in 2003, were:

- To facilitate the economic rehabilitation of interested survivors of trafficking by working with them to generate profitable and viable employment opportunities. These opportunities include the creation of new enterprises or a combination of technical training and job placement.
- To provide consistent support to all the enterprises that have been created during the implementation of the project and build their strength towards economic sustainability
- To continuously build the capacity of the NGO Partners to independently handle the aspect of economic rehabilitation of trafficked victims.
- To educate and orient various stakeholders – the Government, corporate houses, financial organizations and training institutions and involve them as active partners in this entire process of economic rehabilitation of trafficked victims.

ERTV components focused on developing economic opportunities for survivors, but were revised to address the multiple complexities of preparing the beneficiaries to start and run a business. The new components created a more comprehensive support system for survivors and the NGOs as they embarked on this challenge. In addition to changing the project's name in order to emphasize that the beneficiary is proactively fighting the social stigma of having been trafficked, the second project document, ERST, included the following components:

- If called upon, to provide return assistance and facilitate the social reintegration of survivors of trafficking.

- To facilitate the psycho-social rehabilitation of those who need the same through trauma counseling and soft skills building to ensure that they attain a level of trust, motivation and self confidence.

In revisions to the project strategy, the original components were expanded to include trainings in business skills such as functional literacy and customer service. A marketing support component was also added so that IOM could train and provide specialized ongoing assistance to NGOs in this area, which was found to be a major determinant of the success of ERTV/ERST enterprises. The components and their implementation are further detailed in Section 2.2.

2.2 Project Components

Through ERTV/ERST, IOM mobilized a coordinated, multi-stakeholder effort by involving state- and district-level government offices, NGOs, corporations, vocational training institutes, and the survivors themselves to generate viable business opportunities. In total, IOM has worked with 13 different NGOs in 12 different locations to facilitate the successful rehabilitation and reintegration of 494 survivors of trafficking. This project is unique because it is the first large-scale project in India that focuses on enabling survivors of trafficking to achieve financial independence in addition to psychological well-being. In addition, its multi-stakeholder approach, which unites members of the NGO, public and private sectors, is relatively new both within India and internationally.

It should be noted that in some areas, ERTV/ERST projects have built on existing partnerships between state and local governments and counter trafficking NGOs. For example, government has made significant infrastructure and resources available to some NGOs to assist in housing and protecting rescued survivors of trafficking, including IOM beneficiaries.

- *Return Assistance*

The project document articulates the assumption that “[T]he Government is the key agency responsible for the rescue of the victims of trafficking.” To ensure the smooth transportation and return of beneficiaries to their places of origin, IOM proposed to contribute its resources and experience to government departments and law enforcement working in this field. Upon request from the GoI, IOM also proposed to liaise between NGOs working in destination, transit and source areas, and across state and international borders. As detailed in section 3 of the evaluation report, IOM has not been called upon to get involved in this activity.

- *Capacity Building*

IOM offers advice and specialized trainings to NGOs in order to enable them to implement ERTV/ERST independently. The NGOs, in turn, set a positive example for the beneficiaries to strive to work independently themselves. Since these activities enhance NGO abilities to carry out a wide range of counter trafficking activities, the capacity-building component will also be discussed in the context of the project’s other components, including: psycho-social guidance and soft skills development, economic rehabilitation, and project and stakeholder management.

It is also important to note that Memoranda of Understanding between IOM, a partner NGO and other partners include the hiring of an IOM Project Coordinator at the NGO. IOM pays the

Project Coordinator's salary for one year, and he or she is the manager, implementer, and point of contact for the ERTV/ERST project. This person undergoes most of the capacity-building trainings and assistance offered by IOM.

▪ *Psycho-Social Guidance and Soft Skills Development*

IOM's work in this assistance area involves supporting NGO infrastructures already in place and standardizing the psycho-social training of NGO, corporate and vocational partners. Also, consistent involvement of beneficiaries throughout the planning and implementation of the entrepreneurial initiative contributes to their psycho-social rehabilitation by bolstering their self-esteem, confidence and sense of entitlement as entrepreneurs.

Through their existing infrastructures NGOs offer psycho-social counseling, medical care and supervised or non-custodial living arrangements for the beneficiaries, as well as literacy, educational and/or soft skills trainings in many cases.⁴ However, early in the project's implementation, IOM staff noted that many partner NGOs did not have formally trained counselors, and that corporate and vocational trainers were not always sensitive to the psycho-social issues that survivors of trafficking may face. Therefore, a psycho-social component was incorporated into the project strategy. IOM also engaged an expert to develop a training module and reference handbook on psycho-social interventions for victims of trafficking. IOM also proposed to work with NGOs to adapt existing modules on functional literacy to the needs and demands of particular groups of beneficiaries.

In the project document, IOM planned to help NGOs address the difficult issue of survivors reaching out to their families. Survivors of trafficking face a unique challenge in reintegrating with their families and society at large, and lack of acceptance can lead survivors to engage in self-destructive behavior, be re-trafficked, or be vulnerable to other kinds of exploitation. IOM advocates an approach of caution and "informed consent," to protect beneficiaries from such traumatic experiences.

▪ *Economic Rehabilitation*

As this report will illustrate, enterprises have taken a variety of forms based on the interests and capacities of all stakeholders, as well as market demand. All of these opportunities are offered to the beneficiaries based on their aptitude and interests, and after "scanning" the market (described further in the below "capacity-building" section).

IOM reaches out to a wide range of corporations and training institutes who assign important resources to many ERTV/ERST enterprises. In many instances, state and local government offices have been instrumental in ERTV/ERST initiatives by providing infrastructural and financial support to the initiatives. Corporations assist by extending franchises or employment opportunities to groups of beneficiaries, as well as business-specific training, brand promotion services and linkages to the market. Training Institutes assist in imparting vocational and some soft skills training to the beneficiaries, as well as job placement.

⁴ As will be discussed in Part II, during initial implementation of the project, it was found that the development of skills such as basic hygiene and teamwork, as well as at least a basic level of literacy and numeracy, enhanced the beneficiaries' technical skill development. Therefore, the project strategy was revised to include soft skill development.

IOM has the experience, expertise and capacity to offer business support throughout the process of setting up and running an enterprise, including assessing market demand, developing viable business plans, creating and implementing marketing and outreach strategies, and advising on other issues that may arise. IOM's ongoing marketing support to NGO partners and beneficiaries teaches them to strengthen their customer and market base. This, in turn, builds both brand equity and the beneficiaries' capacities to handle all business affairs. The goal of this market support is for the beneficiaries to gain the technical knowledge to work independently, with little help from either IOM or the facilitating NGO. However, for reasons that will be discussed in Part II, most beneficiaries do not manage their enterprises independently.

IOM created a manual on Entrepreneurship Development, which was used to conduct a specialized Training of Trainers Program for NGO representatives and select beneficiaries. Participants were expected to apply what they had learned to the ERST/ERTV enterprises, as well as share it with their colleagues. IOM hopes to create a pool of "Master Trainers" of NGO staff and beneficiaries skilled in developing the entrepreneurial skills of survivors of trafficking, including the psycho-social needs discussed previously. These trainers, in turn, can train future beneficiaries and NGO partners in the ERTV/ERST project components, thereby contributing to NGO partners' independence in the implementation process and the project's sustainability. The effectiveness of these measures will be further examined in Part II.

IOM funds a micro credit assistance program that each NGO manages for its beneficiaries to help them start up their enterprises. If and when they repay the loans, beneficiaries will own the enterprises. Recovered funds could also be used to supplement beneficiaries' training and support business planning and marketing support activities initiated by the facilitating NGOs. Although the NGOs have attempted to institute credit recovery processes to create a revolving fund that can sponsor more ERTV/ERST enterprises, the program has been largely unsuccessful. This weakness and its implications will also be discussed under Part II.

▪ *Project and Stakeholder Management*

In the spirit of the participatory process that characterizes the project, IOM has kept all stakeholders informed by maintaining almost-constant communications with current initiatives and checking in regularly with past initiatives to monitor their progress. This responsiveness has allowed the project to respond and adapt to stakeholder needs as they arise. Annual stakeholder workshops coordinated by IOM allow participants to share and compare experiences.

IOM has maintained a "living" record of project implementation experiences, good practices and lessons learned over the past three years. IOM has also commissioned this evaluation and developed case studies and impact assessments at the levels of the beneficiary, enterprise and NGO partner to gain more insight into how the project can be improved. Process documentation provides strategic as well as operational insights for successfully replicating the project in other parts of India, in the South Asian region, or elsewhere. IOM will present this information in the form of a Do-It-Yourself Handbook at its upcoming information sharing workshop.

PART TWO:

ANALYSIS OF PROJECT PERFORMANCE AND ACHIEVEMENTS

3. VALIDITY OF DESIGN

Discussion of the validity of design seeks to determine whether the strategy and means identified in the project document for achieving ERTV/ERST's objectives are appropriate and follow a logical framework given the economic, social and cultural context of India.

3.1 Design of Project Strategy

Field visits and background research indicate that the project design is appropriate and adequate for India's counter trafficking sector. During interviews, NGO staff expressed appreciation to IOM for addressing the underlying social and economic causes of trafficking through the economic rehabilitation of survivors of trafficking. The project takes a pragmatic view of social stigmatization, addressing the positive role that financial independence and productivity can play in helping survivors of trafficking regain self-confidence and acceptance in society. The project design also capitalizes on India's Corporate Social Responsibility Act by enabling corporations to fulfill the requirement while connecting with government and NGO representatives. Field visits revealed that this project has benefited from the fact that socially responsible corporate behavior is presently in fashion in India.

The project document is not overly detailed, allowing IOM to determine the best strategy for engaging new partners and craft a customized approach that can respond to market demand. Therefore, the project has taken a variety of forms in the diverse states where it was implemented based on the interests, needs and capacities of partners at each project site. However, it was found that this characteristic has resulted in the uneven implementation of the project across India, with the occasional neglect of certain components. Given the comprehensive nature of the ERTV/ERST concept, this could lead to inconsistent results.

ERST/ERTV has been particularly adept at responding to the needs and capacities of both rural and urban areas. For example, in one rural community IOM partnered with a well-established NGO also spearheading a regional counter trafficking network, the District Rural Development Authority, and a famous fashion training institute. This project just finished training its third round of 20 beneficiaries, and focus groups held during the end of the six-month training revealed the beneficiaries to be happy and self-confident. The project has created a pool of 60 highly skilled fashion designers that can manufacture garments requested by clothing stores in nearby cities, or establish smaller home-run businesses. The NGO is presently exploring a way to set up a manufacturing facility. A similar partnership between IOM, an NGO and the same fashion institute in a major metropolitan area yielded a group of 25 equally trained beneficiaries who plan to design and market their own line of clothing to boutiques in the area. Psychological assessments of these beneficiaries were promising as well.

The projects were successful at achieving the goals they set out for themselves in the project document. However, the project document was not very precise in terms of monitoring and evaluation activities. For example, although IOM staff makes regular field visits and maintains almost daily email and phone contact with current projects, oversight is limited with the project's expansion throughout India. In addition, the required reports from the NGOs, which are stipulated in the Memoranda of Understanding (MOU), have been sporadic and incomplete. Recently, IOM renewed efforts to enforce reporting deadlines and content quality, both of which are important steps towards achieving more even implementation and identifying best practices. Also, as addressed in subsection 7.2, structured training programs had very general goals and did not incorporate an "End of Training" evaluation. This inhibits IOM India from fully benefiting from the project's flexible design by adapting its capacity building and coordinating activities to the present needs of its partners.

RECOMMENDATION: A flexible design and flexible intervention strategy were certainly instrumental in addressing the greatly varying stakeholder resources and capacities across project sites, but it is important that all sites be held to the same standards in terms of their expected results. This should also include regular and thorough reporting.

3.2 Monitoring and Indicators

Field visits found that most partner NGOs had record-keeping systems that tracked qualitative changes in individual beneficiaries, such as their health and social behavior. The detail and frequency of these records varied according to NGO policies, and none of the NGOs interviewed had consolidated information on its beneficiaries. The variation and subjectivity of measurements make it difficult to monitor the project's progress, especially as no quantitative and qualitative indicators were clearly identified in the project documents. Although NGO staff could talk about the progress of each beneficiary, and often knew the whereabouts of the beneficiaries who had left the program, no statistics were available and much of the information had not been shared with IOM. Also, project documents do not stipulate that beneficiaries be tracked after they have left NGO care.

Tracking beneficiaries' whereabouts has been inconsistent across partner NGOs. Field visits indicated that some NGOs have had success in tracking beneficiaries who either chose to leave the ERTV/ERST initiative and NGO care or, in a few cases, when a training program support by ERTV/ERST had ended. For example, one NGO has a strong and constant presence throughout the urban area in which it is located, including the semi-urban slums. The Executive Director explained that the NGO made it a point to pay attention to people in the area who could be vulnerable to traffickers, including survivors. In addition, since most of its beneficiaries were from the urban area or nearby rural areas, survivors out of the NGO's care usually remained in the vicinity. In contrast one of the NGOs in a rural area noted that it was nearly impossible to keep track of the beneficiaries who move to urban areas. Although a network permits this NGO to pass its cases on to NGOs in urban areas, often the hand-off failed and the beneficiary was "lost."

In the past year, IOM India engaged a monitoring expert to develop a database system that manages qualitative and quantitative data regarding the status of beneficiaries, but

implementation of this system has not yet been completed. The issue of monitoring survivors extends beyond this project to a larger debate, but this information will be necessary if IOM is to present the ERTV/ERST project concept as an alternative rehabilitation and reintegration model.

RECOMMENDATION: IOM should clearly establish indicators for measuring its standards for reintegration. This information should be disseminated to NGOs on and standardized, regular updates on the status of all beneficiaries should be requested and enforced. This will bolster the significant administrative reforms that IOM India has already put into motion. IOM India can also liaise between partner NGOs when beneficiaries move, in order to ensure that the beneficiary's case is picked up in the new area and possibly join another ERTV/ERST project.

3.3 Return Assistance

This component was added to the ERST project document to improve IOM's ability to respond to the needs of India's counter trafficking community as necessary. However, it has never been implemented. Return assistance is carried out by the GoI, and the fact that the government has not engaged IOM in this may indicate that return assistance is not a role it needs IOM to fill.

RECOMMENDATION: It is not yet clear whether this component should be an integral part of the project. If it is an important option to retain in future initiatives, IOM's role should be clarified with the GoI. Joint activities with the GoI could also be explored if appropriate.

4. RELEVANCE

4.1 Relevance of the Target Group

Field visits revealed that partner NGOs have selected ERTV/ERST beneficiaries based on a wide range of interpretations of the project design. The ERTV/ERST project was based on the assumption that there would be enough interested survivors of trafficking to participate. Project documents describe the target population as "victims of trafficking," assuming that they "have the basic skills and competencies, which could further be developed to manage the enterprises." This language does not reflect the shift of empowering the beneficiary by calling him or her a survivor instead of a victim. In addition, it delegates a great deal of discretion to the NGOs who actually carry out the selection of beneficiaries, and they have interpreted the criteria in a number of ways. NGO selection practices provide insight into the project's potential and limits as a rehabilitation and reintegration tool, and could have an impact on its results.

The two most common variations in NGO selection of beneficiaries are the amount of time since the beneficiaries were rescued and their education levels, both of which may determine what the NGO deems to be the "basic skills and competencies" of beneficiaries. In interviews, some NGO staff expressed the belief that the only skill a beneficiary needed was dedication. However, other NGO staff indicated that survivors without literacy and numeracy skills did not have the necessary abilities to work in or manage an enterprise. In at least one case the Project

Coordinator selected beneficiaries who were at or had completed a Class 10 level of education to participate in fashion design training. In contrast, another NGO successfully trained beneficiaries to overcome these limitations by teaching them basic numeracy and mnemonic devices. These beneficiaries were able to work in a retail outlet by, for example, learning to distinguish between product flavors based on their symbol and color. It is important to note that the revised project strategy includes literacy development as a component. Beneficiaries gain these skills while they work, but no minimum standard is specified.

Many NGO staff members explained that timing was the biggest determinant in their selection of IOM beneficiaries; if survivors entered their care around the time that trainings began, they had the option to join. One NGO selected beneficiaries who had been rescued four or five years prior. They had received extensive psychological counseling, and the NGO saw ERST as advancing their rehabilitation by facilitating economic reintegration. Other NGOs saw psychosocial development and economic rehabilitation as mutually supportive, and chose survivors who had been rescued the month before and expressed an interest in the initiative. The mixture of old and new beneficiaries in both of the above examples ensured that constant training was taking place, and some of the new beneficiaries reported looking to the old beneficiaries as role models.

Recently, IOM staff has become more involved in the beneficiary selection process, requiring that NGOs inform them when a beneficiary leaves the program and asking to meet new beneficiaries. In its correspondence with NGOs, IOM has recommended selecting a group of beneficiaries with a range of backgrounds and capacities. These steps are important because they will foster a more open relationship with NGO partners, in which all work to identify project successes and failures without fear of recourse.

***Conclusion:** A flexible description of the target population has permitted NGOs to select beneficiaries as they see best and implement the program in the way that it most comfortable to them. The variation in selection practices among NGOs provides an important opportunity to investigate whether certain industries actually do require certain competencies, and whether this furthers the objectives of rehabilitation and reintegration. However, in the meantime there is a risk that NGOs will overlook the rehabilitative potential that working in an enterprise holds for the most vulnerable survivors.*

RECOMMENDATION: IOM should take selection practices into consideration when evaluating the progress of beneficiaries. This will become more relevant as the database (described in subsection 3.2) comes into force. IOM should focus on advocating diversity among beneficiaries during its regular contact with NGO staff, and should also consider modifying the project strategy to ensure that the most vulnerable participates.

4.2 Relevance of Selected NGO Partners

Due to the project's heavy reliance on formal partnerships and informal networking, it has been essential that IOM seek out NGOs who are close with local communities, in good standing with state governments, financially stable, and politically influential. Indeed, IOM has succeeded in engaging reputable NGOs from diverse areas of India as partners in implanting ERTV/ERST. To meet this criteria, IOM made a list of NGOs working on counter trafficking issues based on

information from a variety of sources depending on the state. Directories maintained by the Women and Child Welfare Departments of certain states, participation lists from national counter trafficking workshops and training programs and positive media coverage of NGOs were all considered. In areas where the government was involved, this list was shared with the local government to shortlist an NGO partner for the ERTV / ERST project with whom the government had good working relations. Significantly, IOM encountered a shortage of NGOs carrying out counter trafficking activities in India, finding that some organizations did not distinguish between rescued survivors of trafficking and others involved in the sex industry through other means.

IOM India was vigilant in selecting NGO partners who could incorporate the different components of ERTV/ERST into their existing rehabilitation infrastructure. However, few of these NGOs had staff with experience in micro finance. As will be discussed in Section 5.4, there is an inherent tension in relying heavily on existing NGO capacities while imposing constraints on key issues that need to be addressed systematically.

Concerning the selection of states, there was no specific method for deciding which states IOM would work in. The project was initiated in Andhra Pradesh and Delhi, which was logical because this involved a state known as one of the nation's largest source areas and a major destination city—also India's capital. However, expansions of the project were based largely on the interest of state and local governments, the availability and interest of NGOs and chance. Presently, IOM staff has adopted a more systematic approach and is working to expand the project into other key areas that have high incidences of trafficking in persons, such as the Northeast.

The relevance of corporate and vocational partners will be addressed in section 5, in the context of the economic rehabilitation component's effectiveness.

RECOMMENDATION: As IOM assesses the progress of the beneficiaries and enterprises, staff should note variations in conditions, such as NGO qualifications or geographic particularities (such as whether an area is near a state or national border, or is rural or urban) that may affect results. This information can shed light on the qualities IOM India should seek out in future NGO partners and locations.

5. EFFECTIVENESS

This section will examine whether ERTV/ERST has successfully facilitated the rehabilitation and reintegration of survivors of trafficking. To do so, it will address each component⁵ of IOM's intervention to assess the project's quality and responsiveness to the needs of its beneficiaries. Since coordination among stakeholders and the administrative structure as put in place by IOM are key factors in all project components, they will also be addressed in this section.

⁵ Excluding the return assistance component, which is already discussed in section 3.3 and is more or less nonexistent in practice.

5.1 Capacity Building

In the process of implementing ERTV/ERST, IOM India determined that one of the ways in which it could best assist its partner NGOs was by boosting their capacities to help beneficiaries create and manage a viable business. Therefore, IOM directed more resources toward advising NGO staff and beneficiaries, and more structured training programs, such as the Entrepreneurship Development program, were incorporated into later revisions of the project strategy. In addition, IOM has worked with the partner NGOs to offer trainings in customer service, leadership and group dynamism. These reforms were consistent with feedback received during field visits.

IOM has taken an active role in helping NGO partners and beneficiaries acclimate to the business culture by identifying skill areas in which it could provide trainings or support. IOM staff described the shift in NGO mentality as the process of learning to engage customers as informed consumers instead of as philanthropists patronizing the enterprise for charity. Field visits indicated that not all NGOs have made this switch, but IOM has successfully provided appropriate assistance to all NGOs and helped them work within their limits. This process has been successful in improving the relationships between corporate and NGO partners. Now, IOM offers these trainings earlier in the project cycle to help NGO staff adjust more quickly and head off potential problems. Interviews and site visits indicated that NGO staff and beneficiaries were using the skills they had learned in IOM trainings in their day-to-day activities. The beneficiaries indicated that they had acquired all of the skills they felt were necessary to properly run and work at the business.

The creation of new alliances involving partners who have not been involved in counter trafficking activities before has resulted in the sensitization of all partners to counter trafficking issues in general and the situations of survivors in particular. In the process of implementing the project, IOM India and the NGOs have provided on-the-job training to business community representatives, such as managers and trainers who were working with the beneficiaries, in order to sensitize them to and help them engage the beneficiaries more effectively. For example, representatives learned how to better assist illiterate or innumerate beneficiaries and deal with any behavioral problems. It was also necessary to provide HIV/AIDS awareness information to combat some of the misconceptions about it.

IOM also serves as an important repository for information as NGOs learn lessons about how to be competitive—for example, to stock certain supplies in the off-season, when they are cheaper and more readily available. As IOM noted the importance of developing a viable business plan before going ahead with training, it began to work more intensively with NGOs to assess market demand. Some NGOs have taken other measures to make their businesses more viable. For example, one hired an IOM Project Coordinator with a business degree, which differed from the standard practice of hiring a psychosocial specialist for the position. At this NGO, beneficiaries usually receive psycho-social counseling from other NGO staff.

IOM's capacity-building activities range from informal advice to structured training, allowing IOM India to tailor its assistance to best address the needs of individual stakeholders. When structured training programs were introduced in revisions of ERTV/ERST's project strategy,

they had very general goals (as mentioned in subsection 3.1). Achievement of these goals was assessed through interactions with the NGOs and beneficiaries, but no formal evaluation procedure was utilized. Despite this, all participants interviewed for this evaluation were satisfied with the quality of the trainings and felt they had applied the skills they learned. The turnover of NGO staff is very low, so that many of the Project Coordinators have received the Entrepreneurship Training and other trainings offered by IOM. However, some have not, and due to funding constraints IOM cannot hold another structured training. Interviews indicate that regular advising and the distribution of the published Entrepreneurship Development modules have mitigated the consequences of this. Another constraint to capacity-building is the project's limit of one year, which will be discussed in subsection 5.3.

***Conclusion:** Significantly, marketing support and linkages to the business community were the two areas in which NGO staff felt IOM could provide the most valuable support. Over time, IOM India has responded with more extensive and appropriate assistance in these areas.*

RECOMMENDATION: IOM could explore ways to offer structured trainings either regionally or long-distance over the internet in order to increase their accessibility and manage costs. Also, IOM should include an End of Training evaluation in its formal training curriculum, and survey NGOs after some time has passed to determine whether participants have retained and utilized the appropriate skills.

5.2 Psycho-Social Rehabilitation and the Development of Soft Skills

Interviews and focus groups with the beneficiaries confirm that ERTV/ERST has facilitated the psycho-social rehabilitation of beneficiaries. Survivors who had been participating in the project for five months or longer were outgoing and quick to engage NGO, corporate and IOM staff, and wanted to talk about the opportunities they had gained from the project. Most of them had thought about the future, and had plans to continue their studies, get married and/or start their own businesses. A few beneficiaries said they would be interested in learning new skills by working in other types of enterprises or taking additional trainings in areas such as computer literacy and management skills. Many planned to continue working in the ERTV/ERST enterprises in the long term. Feedback from interviews with NGO staff and trainers from vocational training institutes supports these observations.

Another benefit of the project's flexible design is that NGOs can use their insight into the specific situations of beneficiaries and local environment to innovate other methods for furthering shared overall objectives. For example, many NGOs have instituted life skills trainings that address topics such as hygiene and how to use a bank account. One NGO developed a training that focused on dispelling superstition in response to survivors' reports that some traffickers were using superstition, such as pretending to cast spells, as a form of coercion. Positive results from some of these trainings led to their incorporation into the project strategy. In many cases, the project's group-based approach complements the individualized assistance provided by partner NGOs. Learning to live and work in a heterogeneous group has been a challenge for some beneficiaries, but IOM collaborated with NGOs to offer trainings on teamwork to aid the coexistence process.

RECOMMENDATION: This component has the potential to incorporate the goal of prevention, in which beneficiaries are inspired to reach out to vulnerable populations to educate them about the risks of trafficking, in the process furthering their own rehabilitation. Although this has happened in a few isolated cases, this has been limited. IOM should reach out to NGOs to explore whether and how getting involved in prevention can actually further psycho-social rehabilitation and reintegration.

5.3 Economic Rehabilitation

Efficient implementation of the project's economic rehabilitation component has been hindered by its short timeframe. The initiative only receives IOM assistance for one year in total, but enterprises take 8-9 months to start up—not the planned 6 months. As a result, partner NGOs have only 3 months to seek out IOM business support and onsite training before they must take on these tasks themselves. The project's timeframe challenges beneficiaries to undergo entrepreneurship and business-specific technical training at the same time that they are recovering from the multiple psychological and medical traumas associated with trafficking. NGOs' adaptations of the beneficiary selection criteria, discussed in subsection 4.1, could be a response to this. In addition, it takes time to shape the enterprises or formulate the beneficiaries' job descriptions so that they accommodate any special needs; for example, it may be difficult for some beneficiaries to work nights due to safety concerns and transit issues, and others may suffer from physical ailments that inhibit them from completing certain tasks. One initiative realized that survivors needed to be of a certain height to negotiate the enterprise's service counter.

NGOs and beneficiaries have also noted that delays in setting up a business or training program can be a major disappointment for beneficiaries because it can be difficult for them to maintain the motivation necessary to run the enterprise when it finally does come to fruition. This illustrates the potentially tenuous relationship between the project's psycho-social and economic rehabilitation components: there is inherent risk in starting a business, and the stakes are higher because if the business fails this could delay or even inhibit beneficiaries' rehabilitation and reintegration. The beneficiaries will miss out on the benefits of success, such as a boost in confidence and the security that they can earn their livelihood, as well as the opportunity to do so. In addition, they may blame the NGO and leave its supervision, and could be vulnerable to exploitation. Even in successful enterprises, NGOs have acknowledged that, unlike a competitive business, beneficiaries cannot be fired for misconduct or absenteeism. One Project Coordinator stated that this was not a hindrance because beneficiaries would work if they were happy, but that there was a threat that if they were unhappy, the quality of work could suffer, making the enterprise less competitive.

Over the last three years, IOM India has spent more time working with NGOs and beneficiaries to develop viable business plans and mobilize a wider range of resources. However, it has been difficult for ERTV/ERST enterprises to enter and compete in the business world. In interviews, business location and marketing strategies were repeatedly mentioned as determinants of success. For some enterprises, the greatest expense is the electricity and rent at prime locations, leaving little or no profit for the beneficiaries. Other enterprises have received generous donations of land from state and district governments. However, some of these locations have not been suitable for the type of business for which IOM obtained corporate sponsorship or the

beneficiaries themselves chose to launch. This led to a similar result: little profit for the beneficiaries, with no chance to pay off the micro credit loans.

NGOs and IOM have explored options for mitigating the potentially adverse effects of the struggling enterprises. Some NGOs have implemented a rotation policy, in which beneficiaries can rotate through different locations of the same type of business, working with different coworkers and customers or through a variety of enterprises in order to learn new skills. This underlines the fact that, although a business' success reinforces the project objectives of rehabilitation and reintegration, there are numerous benefits to the experience outside of this.

The project design expects that beneficiaries' empowerment through counseling, trainings and inclusion in the entrepreneurial planning and implementation process will help them develop a sense of ownership of the enterprise and confidence in their professional abilities. This sense of ownership would lead certain beneficiaries with leadership qualities to seek out supervisory and management roles in the enterprise, essentially weaning the enterprise from the NGO's care so that the NGO would only provide assistance when necessary. This has only occurred in one case; in many initiatives, beneficiaries have not aspired to management responsibilities or embraced certain aspects of running an enterprise, such as those involving outreach to potential clients. However, it should be noted that the rotation policies described above may have inhibited beneficiaries from developing a desire to own any one enterprise by paying back the micro credit. Also, interviews indicated that NGOs have been reluctant to disengage from the enterprise and encourage the beneficiaries to take over.

The micro finance scheme was conceived as a key aspect of the economic rehabilitation process. Beneficiaries' sense of ownership would be bolstered by the process of paying back loans for some of the business start-up costs, so that they would actually own the enterprise. This scheme has only taken place in one case (the same case as noted in the paragraph above). Overall, NGOs have not yet succeeded in enforcing loan repayment. Also, lack of NGO experience in economic development and micro finance is a contributing factor. There is also a built-in dilemma for the Project Coordinator, who is often charged with both collecting loan repayments from the beneficiaries and counseling them. Many of the delays in repayment are the results of legitimate problems in setting up the business and making a profit; one NGO adapted to this by instituting a six-month grace period after the enterprise is started up, after which enterprises will start making payments.

It is important to note that the micro credit program still has the potential to succeed; IOM has taken major strides in improving business planning, and all stakeholders have gained experience. IOM, the NGOs and beneficiaries have found many ways to adapt to the complexities of implementing the economic rehabilitation component, and operations have improved with time. Interviews revealed that while some Project Coordinators make weekly visits to enterprises to check on the beneficiaries and review their work, other Project Coordinators provide daily support. In some cases, the duration of technical training has been doubled. This gives the beneficiaries more time to grasp the concepts, but also runs the risk of making them more dependent on NGO and corporate supervision, as well as reduces the amount of time they will have to plan and initiate an enterprise. Beneficiaries have also become creative in identifying

ways to improve their enterprises, such as stocking new items or providing additional services in retail outlets, or manufacturing different items in factories.

***Conclusion:** NGOs and beneficiaries now have a better idea of how to make their businesses competitive, and they can make improvements on multiple levels. This can be left to their own initiative or can be enforced by IOM as proposed in the below recommendations.*

RECOMMENDATION: Improvements to this component could entail:

- **Future projects should include a line item in their budgets to provide ongoing marketing support to existing initiatives. If possible, the proposal(s) should be for a two-year time period to better accommodate the wide range of activities that take place.**
- **IOM should assess how long it should take the enterprises to become independent, and develop realistic benchmarks that can be used for NGO self-assessment and IOM's monitoring and evaluation purposes. These benchmarks should act as milestones for how long a business should take before beneficiaries can start paying off their loans and be independent from the NGO business support.**
- **IOM should explore the possibility of commissioning banks or other institutions that specialize in micro finance to run the micro credit recovery program.**
- **IOM and NGOs should also monitor absenteeism as an indicator of beneficiaries' social and economic rehabilitation.**

5.4 Project and Stakeholder Management

IOM India's accessibility to stakeholders, creativity, flexibility and openness to change are impressive and commendable. IOM India staff has improved the program by bringing on an expert in marketing to provide ongoing support, maintaining a stronger presence in the field through visits and frequent communications, and initiating a standardized system to track progress. IOM has also clarified its expectations of all partners by requiring better reporting and asking NGOs to track beneficiaries who have left the project.

ERTV/ERST's design is based on the premise that IOM can mobilize new resources for India's counter trafficking sector to create new partnerships in national efforts to rehabilitate and reintegrate survivors. Indeed, IOM has done this in a number of ways. IOM staff has engaged retail food franchises and appliance manufacturers who offer or donate products and equipment, as well as train beneficiaries in their use. IOM also works with NGO partners to market services to hotels, department stores and other clients. Training institutes have provided beneficiaries with skills in areas such as beauty culture and fashion design. In addition, IOM provides the resources and works with the NGOs to obtain technical training for other enterprises including taxi driving and mechanics, handicrafts and tourism. Generous government contributions include facilities, land and housing. These concrete examples illustrate the opportunities available, and the skill and innovation required to combine them into a comprehensive, viable enterprise. Significantly, they also illustrate how the beneficiaries, most of whom are women and girls, have expanded societal roles for women as entrepreneurs.

IOM has faced challenges in effectively managing ERTV/ERST's diverse group of stakeholders. First, there has been a high turnover in IOM staff, which has led to the loss of much institutional knowledge, as well as a slight time lag as new staff adjusts to administering the project. However, new staff has been hired based on the project's changing needs and have brought with them new expertise, ideas and connections. The office also keeps excellent records of field visits and the status of projects, which mitigate the aforementioned lack of reporting from the field. Second, IOM has few structured enforcement mechanisms to ensure that all partners cooperate as agreed. IOM lacks legal status in India, and depends on its partners, many of whom have more power, influence and connections in India than IOM itself. IOM has partially rectified this situation by transferring Program Coordinator salaries to the NGO in bi-monthly installments and offering additional trainings and support when it identifies a need—something which occurs more frequently with regular communication.

IOM continually works to keep corporate and government partners apprised of the initiatives' progress, taking photos and distributing updates on its own initiative in order to keep all partners invested in the project. Interviews indicated that regular contact has helped IOM to streamline the complex process of setting up the business, and is also essential to creating future opportunities for collaboration. IOM also holds annual stakeholder workshops⁶ to encourage all types of partners to benefit from each others' experiences. It is important to note that IOM's ability to hold more frequent or specific structured workshop is constrained by its budget. After the 2005 workshop, IOM published and disseminated the suggestions and lessons learned that resulted. Significantly, IOM also acted on this information—stakeholder feedback has helped influence many of the reforms already underway. Interviews with conference participants revealed that they found the workshops useful and interesting, and that they would like to attend more of them.

When asked about the quality of its monitoring of NGO partners, IOM India reported that it had experienced some difficulties in verifying the information submitted by NGOs. For example, one NGO did not report to IOM that it had replaced some of its original beneficiaries with new beneficiaries when the original beneficiaries had dropped out of the project. Whether the NGO withheld this information because it believed that IOM did not need to know or out of fear of sanctions, this represented a major discrepancy that IOM India has discovered and addressed. In spite of this complication, records indicate that, overall, IOM India has closely evaluated the NGOs' abilities and has frequently engaged them, seeking improvement in a number of administrative and programmatic areas.

RECOMMENDATIONS: This evaluation recognizes that IOM presently faces serious budget constraints in holding more workshops. In the future, NGO-IOM meetings would allow NGOs to have a more specific conversation about best practices and innovations, and could permit IOM to deepen its administrative reforms. Regional meetings between nearby source and destination areas would be a cost-effective way to achieve this, and could bring forth a new level of coordination.

⁶ One workshop was organized in 2005 and a second one is planned for end of August 2006.

6. EFFICIENCY AND COST-EFFECTIVENESS

6.1 Efficiency in Implementing the Project

No detailed analysis was done on the financial management of the project. However, based on interviews with NGO and IOM administrative and financial staff, it has been possible to note the regular management of financial disbursements. IOM India has maintained detailed and regular records and demanded the same from NGO partners. The project's financial record-keeping encompasses both project-related expenditures, such as training fees and enterprise-related expenditures such as capital investments and stocks. When IOM India encountered financial gaps, they contacted the NGOs in order to clarify them. As discussed in subsection 5.3, ERTV/ERST's micro finance program has been hindered by its low loan repayment rate.

6.2 Cost Effectiveness

Implementation of the project through NGOs, administered by one central IOM office, has been cost-effective. IOM India has only one office, but has developed a system that allows IOM to monitor and support projects all over India. Only one major weakness was noted: the economic rehabilitation component of this project was much more expensive than anticipated. The NGOs required more training than anticipated, and starting up a business cost more money due to the higher cost of capital and the 'seasonability' of certain businesses. Section 5 highlights that IOM India responded to this appropriately and effectively to these issues, with careful consideration of its budget.

7. SUSTAINABILITY, OUTCOME AND IMPACT

7.1 Sustainability

Sustainability of the project is not considered to be a major problem due to the active involvement of the GoI in supporting NGO activities and in funding initiatives. Sustainability will certainly depend on the will of the GoI to continue funding such a capacity building project. As discussed in subsections 5.3 and 6.1, sustainability was lacking in the micro credit scheme, but the project's short timeframe should be taken into account for this analysis.

Another source of concern for the project's sustainability is the issue of retaining beneficiaries and tracking them when they leave. Although no fixed statistic was available, both IOM and NGO staff noted that the retention rates for these projects have been lower than anticipated. Interviews with NGO staff revealed that some beneficiaries left the project prematurely because they were not ready for the challenge of reintegrating into the economy, while others left after a few months because they got married or returned to their families, which could be a good step towards rehabilitation and reintegration. Others' whereabouts are unknown. IOM India has engaged the NGOs to explore solutions, and the new standardized data system will provide more information on how to improve IOM's assessments of beneficiaries' progress and NGOs' tracking abilities.

7.2 Outcome and Impact

Given the relative youth of the program it is difficult to draw definite conclusions on the outcome and impact of the project. Based on the interviews conducted, the capacity building component was certainly successful and has a positive outcome. It is not yet possible to determine whether, in the long term, NGOs or other partners will share their knowledge and build more on the training received. It will certainly depend on various factors such as a continued involvement in similar activities after project closure.

Concerning the assistance to survivors, a well established network, mainly funded by the GoI and other sources available, was already operational and it is difficult to clearly establish the specific outcome and impact of the IOM intervention. However, during the focus groups and interviews organized with beneficiaries, it was possible to note their knowledge of the IOM contribution and it can be concluded that ERTV/ERTV played a positive role in their rehabilitation and reintegration. The implementation of the micro-credit scheme and vocational training, even with all their weaknesses, is recognized as a positive improvement of their living conditions. Psycho-social assistance was also perceived as a positive outcome of the project. One suggestion to consider is to conduct an impact analysis six months to one year after the project's end in order to more precisely assess the added value of IOM assistance. It can be organized in the framework of an extension of IOM assistance or funded by the GoI in the framework of its already well established support to victims of trafficking.

SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

- Recommendation: A flexible design and flexible intervention strategy were certainly instrumental in addressing the greatly varying stakeholder resources and capacities across project sites, but it is important that all sites be held to the same standards in terms of their expected results. This should also include regular and thorough reporting.
- Recommendation: IOM should clearly establish indicators for measuring its standards for reintegration. This information should be disseminated to NGOs on and standardized, regular updates on the status of all beneficiaries should be requested and enforced. This will bolster the significant administrative reforms that IOM India has already put into motion. IOM India can also liaise between partner NGOs when beneficiaries move, in order to ensure that the beneficiary's case is picked up in the new area and possibly join another ERTV/ERST project.
- Recommendation: It is not yet clear whether the project's return assistance component should be an integral part of the project. If it is an important option to retain in future initiatives, IOM's role should be clarified with the GoI. Joint activities with the GoI could also be explored if appropriate.
- Conclusion: A flexible description of the target population has permitted NGOs to select beneficiaries as they see best and implement the program in the way that it most comfortable to them. The variation in selection practices among NGOs provides an important opportunity to investigate whether certain industries actually do require certain competencies, and whether this furthers the objectives of rehabilitation and reintegration. However, in the meantime there is a risk that NGOs will overlook the rehabilitative potential that working in an enterprise holds for the most vulnerable survivors.
 - Recommendation: IOM should take selection practices into consideration when evaluating the progress of beneficiaries. This will become more relevant as the database (described in subsection 3.2) comes into force. IOM should focus on advocating diversity among beneficiaries during its regular contact with NGO staff, and should also consider modifying the project strategy to ensure that the most vulnerable participates.
- Recommendation: As IOM assesses the progress of the beneficiaries and enterprises, staff should note variations in conditions, such as NGO qualifications or geographic particularities (such as whether an area is near a state or national border, or is rural or urban) that may affect results. This information can shed light on the qualities IOM India should seek out in future NGO partners and locations.
- Recommendation: IOM could explore ways to offer structured trainings either regionally or long-distance over the internet in order to increase their accessibility and manage costs. Also, IOM should include an End of Training evaluation in its formal training curriculum, and survey NGOs after some time has passed to determine whether participants have retained and utilized the appropriate skills.

- Conclusion: The psycho-social component has the potential to incorporate the goal of prevention, in which beneficiaries are inspired to reach out to vulnerable populations to educate them about the risks of trafficking, in the process furthering their own rehabilitation.
 - Recommendation: Although this has happened in a few isolated cases, this has been limited. IOM should reach out to NGOs to explore whether and how getting involved in prevention can actually further psycho-social rehabilitation and reintegration.

- Recommendation: NGOs and beneficiaries now have a better idea of how to make their businesses competitive, and they can make improvements on multiple levels. This can be left to their own initiative or can be enforced by IOM. Improvements to this component could entail:
 - Future projects should include a line item in their budgets to provide ongoing marketing support to existing initiatives. If possible, the proposal(s) should be for a two-year time period to better accommodate the wide range of activities that take place.
 - IOM should assess how long it should take the enterprises to become independent, and develop realistic benchmarks that can be used for NGO self-assessment and IOM's monitoring and evaluation purposes. These benchmarks should act as milestones for how long a business should take before beneficiaries can start paying off their loans and be independent from the NGO business support.
 - IOM should explore the possibility of commissioning banks or other institutions that specialize in micro finance to run the micro credit recovery program.
 - IOM and NGOs should also monitor absenteeism as an indicator of beneficiaries' social and economic rehabilitation.

- Recommendation: This evaluation recognizes that IOM presently faces serious budget constraints in holding more workshops. In the future, NGO-IOM meetings would allow NGOs to have a more specific conversation about best practices and innovations, and could permit IOM to deepen its administrative reforms. Regional meetings between nearby source and destination areas would be a cost-effective way to achieve this, and could bring forth a new level of coordination.

ANNEX 1

Evaluation of the ‘Economic Rehabilitation of Trafficked Victims’ (ERTV) and the ‘Economic Rehabilitation of Survivors of Trafficking’ (ERST) Projects in India

Terms of Reference

BACKGROUND:

Trafficking which is a form of abusive and irregular migration for commercial sexual exploitation and other illegal purposes has reached alarming proportions in the past two decades globally; and more so within the South-Asian Region. Across this Region, women, men, girls and boys are trafficked within their own countries or across international borders against their will in what is essentially a clandestine slave trade. The number of trafficked persons is difficult to determine as the corruption, violence and the *Mafioso* surrounding the practice render an estimate of its magnitude virtually impossible. Yet there are some authentic sources of information. For instance the U.S. State Department estimates that 1.5 to 2 million people are trafficked each year worldwide with the majority originating from Asia (over 150,000 from South Asia and 225,000 from South East Asia). Trafficking in women and children in India is rampant and its toll on human suffering is evident in urban and rural pockets throughout the country

Since disparities of economic scales play an important role in the trafficking scenario of the country, IOM’s counter trafficking initiatives – ERTV (Economic Rehabilitation of Trafficked Victims) and ERST (Economic Rehabilitation of Survivors of Trafficking) projects are critical in the reintegration of trafficked victims in order to ensure alternatives that would not only provide financial independence to the survivors of trafficking but also more importantly give them an identity in the society that they can be proud of. In that perspective, the projects also include psychological assistance to the victims. Over a period of three years, the projects have created viable economic options for about 482 victims of trafficking.

These projects are funded under the auspices of the US Presidential Initiative to combat trafficking in persons, announced by President Bush at the United Nations in January 2003, and full funding has been received through the State Department’s Bureau of Population, Refugees and Migration.

In the current scenario of implementation of counter trafficking projects in India, it was often observed that organizations working in the sector did not have adequate expertise or resources to undertake the entire range of activities required to holistically address the challenges of reintegration of trafficked victims. Therefore there was a dire need for a multi-stake holder, coordinated multi-pronged approach to address the problem of human trafficking for economic reasons.

The lessons learnt by IOM India during the implementation of counter-trafficking activities suggest that assistance to victims of trafficking, including return transportation, appropriate economic rehabilitation and reintegration assistance in the source districts, along with provision of access to medical and psycho-social assistance (where needed) are areas that need to be focused on and carefully worked at. Hence, the projects were designed to capitalize on this learning, the work and the field experience of the NGOs and take forth the continuum of services both by complementing and supplementing the NGO's activities and by taking a lead from where the NGO assistance programs end. A very unique approach of these projects is the strong partnerships forged with corporate houses, government, NGOs and the survivors to create viable business options for the survivors

The overall objective of the projects is *to contribute to the successful and sustainable reintegration of the survivors of trafficking by providing return assistance, psycho social rehabilitation and economic rehabilitation opportunities to those who are ready to go back to their families / states of origin.*

The specific objectives to be achieved under the projects are:

- To provide return assistance and facilitate the successful reintegration of victims of trafficking with the society through informed consent
- To facilitate the psycho-social rehabilitation of those who need the same through trauma counseling and soft skills building to ensure that they attain a level of trust, motivation and self confidence
- To facilitate the economic rehabilitation of those who are interested in the process by generating employment opportunities, business ideas and entrepreneurial alternatives, which would be profitable and viable
- To continuously build the capacity of the NGO Partners to independently handle the aspect of economic rehabilitation of trafficked victims.
- To provide consistent support to all the enterprises that have been created during the implementation of the project and build their strength towards economic sustainability
- To educate and orient various stakeholders – the Government, corporate houses, financial organizations and training institutions and involve them as active partners in this entire process of economic rehabilitation of trafficked victims.

OBJECTIVES OF THE EVALUATION:

The main objective of the evaluation is:

To evaluate the overall performance and achievements of the projects in line with the established objectives and project purposes. Focus will be placed on the elaboration of the intervention strategy, including the selection of tools and field of activity, on the collaborative efforts between the stakeholders on the achievements in terms of their contribution to the economic, social and psychological rehabilitation of survivors of trafficking.

More specifically, the evaluation will

- a) analyze the intervention strategies adopted under the ERTV and ERST projects and to what extent the projects are appropriately designed taking into account the socio-economic, political and developmental condition in the country.
- b) analyze the relevance of the strategy of the ERTV/ERST projects to the policy of the Government and to the collaborative efforts already in place with other stakeholders
- c) analyze the relevance of the economic activity vis-à-vis the target beneficiaries selected for economic assistance
- d) evaluate the effectiveness in reaching the objective, project proposes and expected outcomes of the projects as defined in the project documents and verify if a major gap exists between planned and achieved results
- e) analyze the effectiveness in implementing the various components of the projects reintegration services, vocational trainings, placements, psychosocial counseling, business planning, marketing support, micro credit assistance, enterprise promotion, formation and dissemination workshop, including the effectiveness of the collaborative efforts
- f) analyze the gender dimension of the projects
- g) assess the outcome and impact on beneficiaries that could be attributed to IOM projects in terms of socio-economic rehabilitation and development, taking however into account that projects implemented by other entities (NGOs, Governments) could also have contributed to such impact on the same beneficiaries.
- h) analyze the efficiency and cost effectiveness of the project
- i) evaluate the sustainability of the various initiatives implemented and the mechanisms put in place for guaranteeing it.
- j) evaluate IOM overall management of the projects
- k) propose recommendation that is deemed necessary for increasing the performance and impact of ERTV and ERST
- l) propose recommendation for the implementation of similar activities in other regions in India and in other countries based on performance and achievements of the ERTV and ERST
- m) comment on whether the projects are well supported and acknowledged by the various stakeholders

METHODOLOGY: The methodology will consist of an extensive documentation review, series of interviews with the stakeholders and beneficiaries, and field visit to project sites. The duration of the field visit will be organized taking into account the location and availability of the victims and the travel constraints to visit the sites. Focus groups will be organized with beneficiaries if logistically possible. This will be discussed in more detail with the consultant as soon as selected.

IOM office in Hyderabad will be responsible for making available all the necessary documentation for this purpose, coordinating meetings with the stakeholders and making the necessary logistical arrangements.

RESOURCES AND TIMING: The cost of the evaluation will be borne by IOM Hyderabad. A draft report should be made available for comments by end of June 2006, depending however of the organization of the field visit.

As soon as comments from the field are received, a final report should be made available two weeks later, but end of July at the latest.

ANNEX 2

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- *A Guide for Project M&E*, Annex D.
- Asian Development Bank, *Combating Trafficking of Women and Children in South Asia: regional synthesis paper for Bangladesh, India, and Nepal*. New Dehli: Population Council, April 2003.
- F. Laczko, Godziak, E., *Data and Research on Human Trafficking: a global survey*. Geneva, Switzerland: IOM, 2005.
- Free the Slaves, *Recovering Childhoods: combating child trafficking in northern India*, October 2005. http://www.freetheslaves.net/files/Free-the-Slaves_Recovering-Childhoods_India.pdf
- J. Vetticattil, S. Krishnan, *Shattered Innocence: a field study on inter state trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation from Andhra Pradesh*. Catholic Relief Services: Hyderabad, India, September 2002.
- Office of the Inspector General, IOM, *Evaluation of the IOM Project for the Return and Reintegration of Trafficked and Other Vulnerable Women and Children Between Selected Countries in the Mekong Region*, September 2003.
- P. Pravin, “Comments on ‘Anti-Prostitution Laws in for Drastic Revamp.’” *The Times of India*, October 2005. [http://64.233.183.104/search?q=cache:-HCLcBebSKwJ:www.ashanet.org/focusgroups/sanctuary/articles/ATC_Prerana_1_Oct_release_revised.doc+Immoral+Traffic+\(Prevention\)+Act+amendment&hl=de&gl=ch&ct=clnk&cd=9&client=firefox-a](http://64.233.183.104/search?q=cache:-HCLcBebSKwJ:www.ashanet.org/focusgroups/sanctuary/articles/ATC_Prerana_1_Oct_release_revised.doc+Immoral+Traffic+(Prevention)+Act+amendment&hl=de&gl=ch&ct=clnk&cd=9&client=firefox-a)
- Population Council, *Anti-Trafficking Programs in South Asia: appropriate activities, indicators and evaluation methodologies*, summary report of a technical consultative meeting.
- Protection Project, *Country Report for India*. 2005. www.protectionproject.org/india.doc.
- S. Indrani, “Trafficking and Children at Risk.” Sanlaap, January 2006. http://www.ashanet.org/focusgroups/sanctuary/articles/sanlaap_trafficking.doc.
- Sciences Po, Institut D’Etudes Politiques de Paris, *Evaluation of the IOM Assisted Voluntary Return and Reintegration of Ghanaian Child Victims of Trafficking for Labor Exploitation in Yeji Fishing Communities/Republic of Ghana*. IOM, June 2005.
- United Nations General Assembly, 55\25: *Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*, 8 January 2001.
- United States Department of State, *Trafficking in Persons Report*, 2006. June, 2006.
- IOM, *Project Proposal for Economic Rehabilitation of Survivors of Trafficking Project in India what is the date for this???*
- IOM, *Experience Sharing Workshop: economic rehabilitation of trafficked victims—ERTV project India*, 8 February 2005.
- IOM, *Quarterly Progress Reports on Economic Rehabilitation of Survivors of Trafficking Project--India*, April-June 2005, and July-September 2005.
- IOM, *Interim Report on Economic Rehabilitation of Survivors of Trafficking--India to PRM*, October-December 2005.

- IOM, *ERST Project Stakeholders' Meeting Concept Note and Stakeholder Meeting Notes*, 11 November 2005.
- IOM, *Progress Update Report on Economic Rehabilitation of Survivors of Trafficking--India to PRM*, October-January 2006.
- *IOM Evaluation Guidelines*, January 2006.
- IOM, *Terms of Reference: Evaluation of the Economic Rehabilitation of Survivors of Trafficked Victims (ERTV) and the Economic Rehabilitation of Survivors of Trafficking (ERST) Projects in India*, May 2006

ANNEX 3

NARRATIVE OF FIELD VISIT TO INDIA

19-30 June, 2006

Visit to India

Please note that, with the exception of Delhi, the consultant was accompanied by IOM staff at all times. In Delhi, she was accompanied by the Project Coordinator. With the exception of trips to and within Mumbai and Delhi, she traveled by IOM vehicle.

Monday, 19 June: Hyderabad, Andhra Pradesh

In the morning, went to IOM India's office. Interviewed two staff members (out of three), and reviewed project files and documentation. In the afternoon, visited the offices of a partner NGO. Interviewed the NGO's Assistant Director and Project Coordinator (separately). Visited two enterprises: a food retail outlet and a combined book-binding/furniture manufacturing and repair unit. Held focus groups with beneficiaries at both locations. In the evening, visited a food retail outlet supervised by another partner NGO, and held a focus group with the three beneficiaries working there.

Tuesday, 20 June: Hyderabad, Andhra Pradesh

Spent the day doing further interviews and documentation review with IOM staff.

Wednesday 21 June: Cadapah, Andhra Pradesh

In the morning, drove to Cadapah. Spent the afternoon at the site of an ERTV/ERST training institute, holding a focus group with beneficiaries, the Project Coordinator and vocational trainer. Also held informal discussions with and saw the work of the beneficiaries. In the late afternoon, interviewed the NGO's Executive Director.

Thursday 22 June: Mysore, Karnataka

In the morning, drove to Mysore. Spent the afternoon meeting with the NGO's Project Coordinator and two beneficiaries. Toured the NGO's new facility. Held informal discussions with more beneficiaries, and visited retail stands displaying their handicrafts.

Friday 23 June: Mysore, Karnataka

Focus groups with beneficiaries cancelled due to evaluator's illness

Saturday 24 June: Travel

Drove to Bangalore.

Sunday 25 June: Mumbai, Maharashtra

In the early morning, flew from Bangalore to Mumbai. Spent most of the day at the NGO facility, which includes training facilities for the fashion program underway. Conducted a focus group with NGO staff (including Executive Directors and the Project Coordinator), and later with beneficiaries. Interviewed the vocational trainer and toured the facilities.

Monday 26 June: Delhi, Haryana

In the early morning, flew to Delhi. Spent most of the day at the partner NGO facility. Toured the facility and interviewed the Executive Director, Director, Project Coordinator, Marketing Coordinator and counsellor. Also held a focus group with four beneficiaries attending a beauty culture training, and visited an ERTV/ERST food retail enterprise.

Tuesday 27 June: Delhi, Haryana

Spent the day touring multiple ERTV/ERST food retail outlets throughout Delhi and interviewing beneficiaries working in the outlets. Also held a large-scale focus groups with over 20 ERTV/ERST beneficiaries who had received a beauty culture training and were awaiting job placement, worked in retail food outlets, or were soon to begin training in a newly established ERTV/ERST laundry facility (on the NGO's premises). Also interviewed NGO staff of its job placement facility.

Wednesday 28 June: Travel

Spent the morning touring multiple ERTV/ERST food retail outlets throughout Delhi and interviewing beneficiaries working in the outlets. Flew from Delhi to Hyderabad.

Thursday 29 June: Vijaywada, Andhra Pradesh

In the morning, visited IOM India to do a final documentation review. In the late morning, drove to Vijaywada. Upon arrival in the evening, met with NGO management and the Project Coordinator.

Friday 30 June: Vijaywada, Andhra Pradesh

In the morning and early afternoon, visited ERTV/ERST manufacturing facilities and held focus groups with beneficiaries and trainers from: a book-binding unit, a textile printing and tailoring unit, and a bakery unit. Field visits concluded.

ANNEX 4
TABLE OF LOCATIONS, ENTERPRISES AND BENEFICIARIES

Visited by evaluator ?	Location	Number of Beneficiaries	Type of Business or Employment
19/6	Hyderabad, Andhra Pradesh (A.P.)	29	Office Cleaning Food Retail Kiosk Book -binding
19/6	Hyderabad, A.P.	7	Drive-way Sales Women Food Retail Kiosk
21/6	Cadapah, A.P.	46	Beauty Parlor, Cosmetic Franchise and Crafts Bazaar Tiffin Centres Garment Making
21/6	Cadapah, Andhra Pradesh, A.P.	15	Garment Making
N/A	Nellore, A.P.	20	Beverage Retail Outlet Dairy / Vermiculture
30/6	Vijaywada, A.P.	75	Book Binding unit Kalamkari Textile Printing and Garment Making Bakery Unit
N/A	Srikakulam, A.P.	38	Beverage Retail Kiosk Surface Ornamentation and Garment Making Food Retail Outlet
N/A	Bhubaneshwar, Orissa	12	Paper and Jute Bag Manufacturing Unit
N/A	Kolkata, West Bengal	50	Amul Food Parlour, Georgia Coffee Outlet, Café Coffee Day Outlet, Internet Café and Gift Stall, Kwaliti Walls Icecream and Softy corner Garment Manufacturing
28-29/6	New Delhi	78	Laundry unit Beauty Parlor Food Retail Outlets
25/6	Mumbai, Maharashtra	38	Garment construction Unit Bakery Unit Drive-way Sales Women
N/A	Goa	41	Laundry Unit Food Kiosks Drive-way Sales Women/ Beauty Parlors
22/6	Mysore, Karnataka	20	Handicraft Emporium Travel Agency Beauty Parlor Food Retail Outlet
N/A	Pondicherry, Tamil Nadu	15	Mobile Restaurant Beverage Retail Kiosk
	Total	494	